

Appendix D

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate Vulnerability Assessment

Vermont's Wildlife Action Plan 2015

Introduction

During 2013 a group of Vermont Fish & Wildlife Department biologists and Chris Hilke, Climate Adaptation Program Manager for the Northeast Regional Office of National Wildlife Federation, collaborated to assess the vulnerability of fish, wildlife, plants and their habitats to climate changes. As part of this Vermont Species & Habitat Climate Vulnerability Assessment, the team investigated 18 key species, 20 upland habitats, 11 wetland habitats, and 13 freshwater habitats as shown the tables on the following pages. One Department biologist used a NatureServe tool to add in 13 more butterfly species. Species included Species of Greatest Conservation Need and important “surrogate” species that are widely considered representative of particular habitat types. Species assessments culminated in an overall vulnerability rating for climate-specific and non-climate stressors and an associated confidence score (see Rating Key at bottom of spreadsheet for details). Climate change vulnerability assessments were similarly conducted for Vermont's upland and wetland natural communities. For efficiency, the 95 natural community types were grouped into categories based on the environmental factors that drive their development and that could affect their susceptibility to climate change. Some natural community types were assessed individually and freshwater habitats were also assessed.

The most important lesson taken from this exercise is that species (and habitat) responses to climate change will not be uniform. For some, climate change may not be a significant threat, however if a species is already subjected to other stresses, climate change impacts may push that species over the edge. This is an important consideration to take into account. More information on climate change and wildlife conservation can be found in chapter 3: Climate Change & Conservation.

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate					Notes
Species and Habitats	H Thermal Stress	I Toxic Substances- Pollution	J Habitat Fragmentation	K Inventory Need	
Key Species (Bold text =SGCN)					
Jefferson salamander					
Northern white cedar					Competition effects this species broadly
Fingernail clam	X	X			
Beaver			X		Keystone wetland builder - vulnerable via direct take
Bobcat					Coyote and fisher competition
Canada Lynx			X		trapping in Canada impacts Lynx in VT
Brook Trout	X	X	X		Rating is consistent w/ other states. Water temp is key, sedimentation also key issue
Wood Turtle			X		Other threats - Pet trade, agriculture and egg predation
Pearlshell mussel		X	X		
Fallfish			X		Risk by gravel scour when eggs present (May) 63F
Smelt					
Lake trout					Sea lamprey. Supplemental stocking
Bald Eagle		X			
Bicknell's Thrush					Red squirrel predation tied to cone production, limited by patch size
Common Loon		X			direct impacts from fishing gear (hooks and lead)
Red Oak			X		A southern oak species so favored with CC, deer browse impacts seedling development
Sugar Maple					Likely climate loser over 100yr. Managed in sugar bushes which promotes over others
West Virginia White	X		X		
Bog Copper					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Edward's Hairstreak					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Early Hairstreak					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Hackberry Emperor					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Tawny Emperor					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Jutta Artic					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Cobweb Skipper					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Mulberry Wing					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Broad-winged Skipper					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Black Dash					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Dion Skipper					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Two-spotted Skipper					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species
Dusted Skipper					Climate vulnerability and confidence score only performed for this butterfly species

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate Vulnerability Assessment											Exposures & Key Climate											
Species and Habitats	Vulnerability			Sensitivity Factors							A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L
	Climate Vulnerability Rating	Confidence Score	Vulnerability to non-climate stressors	Habitat specificity	Edge of range	Enviro or physiological tolerance	Interspecific or phenological dependence	Mobility	Exotic Pathogens or Invasive Species	Annual temperature - Increase	Seasonal temperature - Increase	# Hot days - More	# Cold days - Fewer	Variability - Increase	Annual precipitation - Increase	Seasonal precipitation - Variable	Heavy rainfall events - Increase	Soil moisture - Decrease	Snow - Decrease	Spring flows - Earlier	Summer low flow - Longers	
Wetland Habitats																						
Cattail Marsh	L	M	L												X	X						
Shallow Emergent Marsh	M	M	M												X	X		X				
Marsh and Sedge Meadow (Formation)	M	M	M												X	X					X	
Alluvial Shrub Swamp	M	M	L													X		X				
Basin swamps & wetlands	H	M	M														X	X			X	
Floodplains	H	M	M													X	X	X		X		
Ground water seepage & Flood swamp	L	M	L												X		X		X	X	X	
Open peatlands (precip-dependent)	M	M	L							X	X	X		X		X		X	X			
Open peatlands (ground-fed)	L	M	M													X		X				
Floodplain Forests	H	M	M												X	X	X		X			
Wet Shores	H	M	M														X	X			X	
Upland Habitats																						
Alpine Meadow	E	M	M							X	X	X	X		X	X		X	X			
Spruce-Fir-Northern Hardwood	M	M	M							X	X	X	X		X	X		X	X			
Northern Hardwood Forest	L	M	L									X	X	X		X		X				
Oak-Pine - Dry Mesic Forests & Woodlands with deeper soils	L	M	M													X	X					
Rocky Forests and Woodlands	L	M	L													X		X				
Oak-Pine Southern Rocky - Southern Dry Rocky Forests and Woodlands	M	L	L													X		X				
Outcrops and upland meadows	N	L	L													X		X				
Cliffs and Talus	L	M	L													X		X				
Upland shores	M	M	H															X		X		
Subalpine Krummholz	E	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Montane Spruce-fir	M	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Red Spruce-Heath Rocky Ridge	M	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Montane Yellow Birch-Red Spruce Forest	M	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Red Spruce-Northern Hardwood	L	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Lowland Spruce-Fir Forest	M	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Boreal Talus Woodland	M	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Cold-Air Talus Woodland	H	M								X	X	X		X	X			X	X			
Limestone Bluff Cedar-Pine Forest	L	M														X	X	X				
Transition Hardwood Talus Woodland	L	M														X	X					
Dry Oak Woodland	H	L														X	X					

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate	Change Factors													Non-Climite Stressors							
	M	N	O	P	Q	R	S	T	U	V	W			A	B	C	D	E	F	G	
Species and Habitats	Ice dynamics - Changing	Fluctuating lake levels - Increase	Lake stratification	Flood events - Increase	# of short-term droughts - Increase	Storms - Increase	Fire	Growing season - Longer	Onset of spring - Earlier	Onset of fall - Later	Biological interactions	Other	List of exposures with the greatest Negative	List of exposures that might be beneficial	Acidity	Habitat Alteration- Altered Hydrology	Invasive Species	Channel Erosion- Sedimentation	Encroachment	Land Erosion	Nutrient Loading
Wetland Habitats																					
Cattail Marsh		X									X		N	T, U, V		X	X		X		
Shallow Emergent Marsh		X		X	X						X		I	T		X	X		X		
Marsh and Sedge Meadow (Formation)		X		X	X						X					X	X		X		
Alluvial Shrub Swamp					X						X	X	I, S, C	U, T		X			X		
Basin swamps & wetlands	X	X		X				X					M, P			X	X		X		
Floodplains	X	X		X		X		X	X	X	X	K					X	X	X		
Ground water seepage & Flood swamp					X	X		X			X	X		X		X	X				
Open peatlands (precip-dependent)					X	X	X				X		G, Q								
Open peatlands (ground-fed)		X			X						X		G, I, Q			X					
Floodplain Forests	X	X		X		X		X	X	X	X		K, P, N,				X	X	X		
Wet Shores	X	X		X				X	X	X	X		M, P, W			X	X	X	X		
Upland Habitats																					
Alpine Meadow					X	X		X	X		X		B, C, J			X	X				
Spruce-Fir-Northern Hardwood					X	X		X	X				D, I, J, T	F	X				X		
Northern Hardwood Forest					X	X			X		X		B, C, D, I, Q, W				X				
Oak-Pine - Dry Mesic Forests & Woodlands with deeper soils					X	X	X						Q, Z			X	X				
Rocky Forests and Woodlands					X	X	X						Q, Z		X		X				
Oak-Pine Southern Rocky - Southern Dry Rocky Forests and Woodlands					X	X	X						C, Q				X				
Outcrops and upland meadows					X						X		B, C, J			X			X		
Cliffs and Talus					X	X							C, I						X		
Upland shores	X			X	X						X		M, N, P			X	X				
Subalpine Krummholz					X						X	X	I, A	F							
Montane Spruce-fir					X				X			X	I, A	F							
Red Spruce-Heath Rocky Ridge					X	X	X		X		X	X	I, A, S	F							
Montane Yellow Birch-Red Spruce Forest					X	X			X	X		X	I, A	F							
Red Spruce-Northern Hardwood					X	X	X	X	X	X		X	I, A	F							
Lowland Spruce-Fir Forest				X	X	X	X		X			X	I, A	F							
Boreal Talus Woodland					X				X	X		X	I, A	F							
Cold-Air Talus Woodland					X	X		X	X	X	X	X	I, A	F							
Limestone Bluff Cedar-Pine Forest					X	X	X				X		Q, W				X				
Transition Hardwood Talus Woodland					X	X	X				X		Q, W				X				
Dry Oak Woodland					X	X	X						Q, C				X				

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate					Notes
H	I	J	K		
Thermal Stress	Toxic Substances-Pollution	Habitat Fragmentation	Inventory Need		
Wetland Habitats					
Cattail Marsh		X	X	invasives - Phragmites	
Shallow Emergent Marsh		X	X	invasives	
Marsh and Sedge Meadow (Formation)		X	X	invasives	
Alluvial Shrub Swamp		X	X		
Basin swamps & wetlands		X	X	Variability of water level could impact dragonfly transformation.	
Floodplains		X	X	Elm was once an important component to floodplains	
Ground water seepage & Flood swamp			X	Most vulnerable species include Black ash (AB) & Hemlock (WA)	
Open peatlands (precip-dependent)				Black spruce and Sphagnum - Impacts of drying	
Open peatlands (ground-fed)				Sphagnum is most vulnerable species	
Floodplain Forests		X	X	Boxelder is non-native and likely to expand	
Wet Shores					
Upland Habitats					
Alpine Meadow				More krumholz?	
Spruce-Fir-Northern Hardwood			X	Most vulnerable species include Spruce & Fir	
Northern Hardwood Forest			X	Most vul is Hemlock. Oaks & hickory will benefit	
Oak-Pine - Dry Mesic Forests & Woodlands with deeper soils			X	Hemlock (HWA) will decrease; oaks and hickories will increase	
Rocky Forests and Woodlands			X	Possible increase in red pine; possible decrease in N. white cedar due to drought and temp increase	
Oak-Pine Southern Rocky - Southern Dry Rocky Forests and Woodlands			X	increase in oaks, hickories, white pine, and pitch pine	
Outcrops and upland meadows				All woody species are likely to decrease in abundance due to heat and drought stress.	
Cliffs and Talus					
Upland shores				Encroachment of woody species if there is less ice-scour and flooding.	
Subalpine Krumholz				Less spruce and fir - area compressed	
Montane Spruce-fir				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Red Spruce-Heath Rocky Ridge				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Montane Yellow Birch-Red Spruce Forest				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Red Spruce-Northern Hardwood				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Lowland Spruce-Fir Forest				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Boreal Talus Woodland				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Cold-Air Talus Woodland				Less spruce and fir, more hardwood	
Limestone Bluff Cedar-Pine Forest					
Transition Hardwood Talus Woodland				less cedar more red pine	
Dry Oak Woodland				< hemlock, more pitch pine if more fires, more hickory if not	

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate Vulnerability Assessment										Exposures & Key Climate											
Species and Habitats	Vulnerability			Sensitivity Factors						A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L
	Climate Vulnerability Rating	Confidence Score	Vulnerability to non-climate stressors	Habitat specificity	Edge of range	Enviro or physiological tolerance	Interspecific or phenological dependence	Mobility	Exotic Pathogens or Invasive Species	Annual temperature - Increase	Seasonal temperature - Increase	# Hot days - More	# Cold days - Fewer	Variability - Increase	Annual precipitation - Increase	Seasonal precipitation - Variable	Heavy rainfall events - Increase	Soil moisture - Decrease	Snow - Decrease	Spring flows - Earlier	Summer low flow - Longers
Freshwater Habitats																					
Medium-sized river (4-6 order)	M	M								X	X	X					X				X
Large river (7+ stream order)	L	M									X	X					X				X
High gradient, coldwater acidic, 1-2 order	H	H								X	X	X	X	X		X	X		X	X	X
High gradient, coldwater, not acidic, 1-2 order	H	H								X	X	X		X		X	X			X	X
Low gradient marsh	M	M								X	X	X	X			X	X				X
Lake Champlain valley	M	M								X	X	X		X		X				X	X
High Elevation Lake	M	L	L								X	X		X						X	
Dystrophic Lake	M	L	L								X	X		X							
Lake - Oligotrophic, Stratified	L	H	L							X	X	X	X								
Mesotrophic-Eutrophic Lake (stratified)	M	M	M							X	X	X	X			X			X		
Mesotrophic-Eutrophic Lake (unstratified)	H	M	M							X	X	X	X	X		X			X		
Unstratified lakes	M	H	H							X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X
Stratified Lakes	M	H	H							X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate	Change Factors											Non-Climate Stressors									
	M	N	O	P	Q	R	S	T	U	V	W		A	B	C	D	E	F	G		
Species and Habitats	Ice dynamics - Changing	Fluctuating lake levels - Increase	Lake stratification	Flood events - Increase	# of short-term droughts - Increase	Storms - Increase	Fire	Growing season - Longer	Onset of spring - Earlier	Onset of fall - Later	Biological interactions	Other	List of exposures with the greatest Negative	List of exposures that might be beneficial	Acidity	Habitat Alteration- Altered Hydrology	Invasive Species	Channel Erosion- Sedimentation	Encroachment	Land Erosion	Nutrient Loading
Freshwater Habitats																					
Medium-sized river (4-6 order)				X	X								L, C, P	F							
Large river (7+ stream order)				X	X								L, C, P	F, T							
High gradient, coldwater acidic, 1-2 order				X	X								F, H								
High gradient, coldwater, not acidic, 1-2 order				X	X	X							C, H, L	F, H							
Low gradient marsh				X	X								C, L	F							
Lake Champlain valley				X	X								C, L	F							
High Elevation Lake		X			X									B, M	X	X					
Dystrophic Lake		X		X	X							X	P, Q	B, M	X	X					
Lake - Oligotrophic, Stratified	X	X	X	X	X							X	A, B, C, D					X	X	X	
Mesotrophic-Eutrophic Lake (stratified)	X	X	X	X	X	X		X			X		A, B, C, D, N				X		X	X	X
Mesotrophic-Eutrophic Lake (unstratified)	X	X		X	X	X		X			X		B, C, N	X			X		X	X	X
Unstratified lakes	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X						X	X	X		X
Stratified Lakes	X	X	X	X		X											X	X	X		

Vermont Species & Habitat Climate					
Species and Habitats	H Thermal Stress	I Toxic Substances- Pollution	J Habitat Fragmentation	K Inventory Need	Notes
Freshwater Habitats					
Medium-sized river (4-6 order)					Compositional changes may include loss of pearlshell
Large river (7+ stream order)					Compositional changes include an increase in the number of warm water species
High gradient, coldwater acidic, 1-2 order					Potential loss of coldwater stenotherms
High gradient, coldwater, not acidic, 1-2 order					Potential loss of coldwater stenotherms
Low gradient marsh					Potential loss of coldwater stenotherms
Lake Champlain valley					
High Elevation Lake					Most vulnerable species include brook trout
Dystrophic Lake					Most vulnerable species include brook trout
Lake - Oligotrophic, Stratified		X			Most vulnerable species include Lake trout & Round Whitefish
Mesotrophic-Eutrophic Lake (stratified)		X			Lake trout, smelt & pike will be most vulnerable
Mesotrophic-Eutrophic Lake (unstratified)		X			
Unstratified lakes					
Stratified Lakes					

Vulnerability Rating Key		
Code		Description
E	Extremely Vulnerable	Abundance and/or range extent in Vermont extremely likely to substantially decrease (>75% loss) or disappear by 2050
H	Highly Vulnerable	Abundance and/or range extent in Vermont likely to decrease significantly (25-75% loss) by 2050
M	Moderately Vulnerable	Abundance and/or range extent in Vermont likely to decrease (10-25% loss) by 2050
L	Slightly Vulnerable	Available evidence does not suggest that abundance and/or range extent in Vermont will change (decrease, 5 - 10% loss) by 2050
N	Not Vulnerable, No Effect	Abundance and/or range extent in Vermont likely to increase or decrease by less than 5% by 2050
B	Increase Possible or Likely	Available evidence suggests that abundance and/or range extent in Vermont is likely to increase (>15% increase) by 2050
U	Unknown/Uncertain	Available evidence not available or not conclusive at this time

Confidence Ratings		
Code		Description
L	Low	Not very confident (0-30% certainty in vulnerability score)
M	Moderate	Somewhat confident (30-60% certainty in vulnerability score)
H	High	Very confident (>60% certainty in vulnerability score)

Non-Climate Stressors	
Code	Description
A	Acidity/Pollution
B	Habitat Alteration/Altered Hydrology
C	Invasive Species
D	Channel Erosion/Sedimentation
E	Encroachments
F	Land Erosion
G	Nutrient loading
H	Thermal Stress
I	Toxic Substances/Pollution
J	Habitat Fragmentation
Enter as free text	Other

Exposures & Key Climate Change Factors				
	Code	Parameter	Trend	Projections (range = low to high emissions scenario)
Temperature	A	Annual temperature	increase	by 2050, projected increase 3.7 to 5.8°F; by 2100, 5.0 to 9.5°F
	B	Seasonal temperature	increase	by 2050, projected increase in winter (DJF) 4.3 to 6.1°F; summer (JJA) 3.8 to 6.4°F
	C	# Hot days	more	more frequent and more intense; by end of century, northern cities can expect 30-60+ days of temperatures >90°F
	D	# Cold days	fewer	reduction in days with cold (<0° F) temperatures
	E	Variability	increase	greater variability (more ups and downs)
Hydrology	F	Annual precipitation	increase	by end of century, projected total increase of 10% (about 4 inches per year)
	G	Seasonal precipitation	variable	more winter rain, less snow; by 2050, winter precipitation could increase by 11 to 16% on average; little change expected in summer, but projections are highly variable
	H	Heavy rainfall events	increase	more frequent and intense
	I	Soil moisture	decrease	reduction in soil moisture and increase in evaporation rates in the summer
	J	Snow	decrease	fewer days with snow cover (by end of century could lose 1/4 to 1/2+ of snow-covered days; increased snow density)
	K	Spring flows	earlier	earlier snowmelt, earlier high spring flows; could occur 10 days to >2 weeks earlier
	L	Summer low flows	longer	extended summer low-flow periods; could increase by nearly a month under high emissions scenario
	M	Ice dynamics	changing	less ice cover, reduced ice thickness
	N	Fluctuating lake levels	increase	greater variability, greater amount of change in lake levels
	O	Lake stratification		some lakes may stratify earlier
Extreme events	P	Flood events	increase	more likely, particularly in winter and particularly under the high emissions scenario
	Q	# of short-term droughts	increase	by end of century, under high emissions scenario, short terms droughts could occur as much as once per year in some places
	R	Storms	increase	more frequent and intense (ice, wind, etc.)
	S	Fire		more likely
Phenology	T	Growing season	longer	by end of century, projected to be 4 to 6 weeks longer
	U	Onset of spring	earlier	by end of century, could be 1 to almost 3 weeks earlier
	V	Onset of fall	later	by end of century, could arrive 2 to 3 weeks later
	W	Biological interactions		could potentially be disrupted